



#### Making Cringe Content: The Performativity of Algorithms in Cultural Production

Ashley Mears Boston University Oxford OII 03.09.23

## virality appears spontaneous



Star Wars kid Drunken Jedi

14M views

YouTube | 15yr



#### All Videos







3 days ago · 56.1M Views 901 293K

The WORST Daughter EVER! 4 days ago · 4M Views **⊷**12 € 43K



She Thought Her Hair Was CUT! 🕵 🎌 4 days ago · 6.7M Views 15K

## content farm





:04

She Thought His Tongue Was STUCK! 5

6 days ago · 981.9K Views 19K

•• 🙈 6 days ago · 1.7M Views 6.2K

Mom Left Her Baby On Top Of The Car! She Thought The Door Was REAL! 😂 a week ago · 73.6M Views 🗃 🗋 🖸 567K



When He Found Out He Was a DAD! 😡 Rude Guy At Movie Gets Big KARMA 🍪 Bad Boss Gets INSTANT KARMA 🍪 .





a week ago - 56.5M Views

a week ago · 1.4M Views 1000 5 3K

a week ago . 8.9M Views 25K





# Digital and in-person immersive ethnography



- Immersive ethnography
  - digital and IRL
  - My own page

## • 60 Interviews content creators

- White, age 25 50
- Entertainers / Artists: 47
- Magicians: 22

## Digital and in-person immersive ethnography







Ashley Valentine Published by Ashley Mears 2 · 18 hrs · 🔇

...

Yes.





#### NEGATIVE FEEDBACK

0 Hide All Posts 1 Hide Post **0** Report as Spam **0** Unlike Page

43 Likes, Comments & Shares

BRANDED CONTENT DISTRIBUTI		View Breakdown	
955	955	0	
Total Reach	Organic Reach	Paid Reach	
955	955	0	

Total Organic Paid Impressions Impressions Impressions





Juar U 182

312 Comments 29 Shares

5682     People Reached       562     Likes, Comments & Shares					
25 0 Photo Views Link Clic	cks Other Clicks				
View More Details					
NEGATIVE FEEDBACK					
8 Hide All Posts	25 Hide Post				
0 Report as Spam	<b>0</b> Unlike Page				
562 Likes, Comments &	Shares				
BRANDED CONTENT					

BRANDED CONTENT DISTRIBUTION		View Breakdown	
5682	5682	0	
Total Reach	Organic Reach	Paid Reach	
5682	5682	0	
Total Impressions	Organic Impressions	Paid Impressions	

# working with algorithms

#### step-by-step codes for computers to act on data





"So cringe!" Alex, li<u>ve streamer</u>

the puzzle

### Q: How do creators interact with algorithms?

Labor Process

#### **Creative Decisions**

- Datafication
- Alienation
- Simplification
- Replication
- Gamification
- Fusion



- the reproduction of algorithmic values
- the performativity of algorithms

## 1. datafication

Check Our Release Notes to See What's New As we continue to improve Creator Studio, we'll detail all of our major updates for you. Head over to Creator Studio's Education	✓ Insights Performance	Last 7 Days
Center to read our release notes and stay up to date.           Read Release Notes         Dismiss	<b>90,216</b> 3-Second Video Views ▼ 63.4%	<b>10,439</b> 1-Minute Video Views ▼ 61.1%
Recent Posts Last 7 Days Posts •	<b>42,446</b> Minutes Viewed ▼ 62.5%	<b>0:09</b> Average Minutes Viewed
HE WAS NOT EXPECTING TH     +117.9x     35K     239       Yesterday 9:05 PM     Distribution     Views     Engagement	√ Go to Insights	
Discover the best performing content for Facebook by testing different versions of your video posts agains each other.	Start Setup	
Try It Now Dismiss	✓ Insights Performance	Last 7 Days
Recent Posts Last 7 Days Posts	<b>236,970</b> 3-Second Video Views <b>4 25.3%</b>	<b>46,062</b> 1-Minute Video Views ▲ <b>115%</b>
<ul> <li>Losing your memory. And you</li> <li>Yesterday 9:30 PM</li> <li>Ashley Valentine</li> </ul>	<b>155,939</b> Minutes Viewed	0:16 Average Minutes
Image: Non-Ward Structure       HIS PHONE FLOATS Image: Imag	▲ 76.5%	▲ 48%
	1 CO 10 III	olginto.





(i) Live Broadcast Summary How your 6:37 live broadcast performed. 23 0 Peak Live Viewers Shares Reactions Comments 40 20 0:00 1:00 2:00 3:00 4:00 5:00 6:00 3-Second Video Views 95 1-Minute Video Views 19 Average Minutes Viewed 0:26 Minutes Viewed 01:03:09

"What we do for these silly little videos is very scientific. We don't post just random videos."

"following a formula."

#### "mathematical."

#### 2. alienation (from taste)



Cringe Silly Mindless Shitainment

#### She THOUGHT She Got MARRIED! 🕭

45 weeks ago · 760.5M Views

If people wanted the avante garde, we'd give it to them. But they want dumb ass shit. - Will, filmmaker

🔁 😝 1.9K

### 2. alienation (from body)



I think that works: her face, her ass. Face, ass. People will watch that. - On set with Will, filmmaker

#### 2. objectified body limits : cat-and-mouse "attention games"



"People will think they're gonna see up her skirt... but don't actually show her cooter." On set with Addie and Elsa



My little comment has been like, "it turns out my dignity online has a price, and the price of my dignity, monthly, is \$80,000. I'm a hundred percent good with that price." - Madison, singer

(not relational work, Bayme 2016)

#### 2. alienation leads to inauthentic content

#### Viral: situational authenticity



#### cleaning lady GIFTED MASSIVE APT! 🥰 12 weeks ago · 113M Views 🗘 🖓 💱 1.9K

"normal people," "fake" videos

#### Influencers: personal authenticity



"real passion" for plant-based food #fishgate (Christin 2021)

## 3. simplification



he lied about being in a wheelchair they scared him! (Scripted Dramatic Scene)

12 weeks ago · 49.2M views

We lean heavily into *all* the stereotypes. We've been halfway through a video before where it was a criminal and a cop and Henry walks out and goes, "Why is the cop black? And the criminal white? Swap the characters." ... Like, if it's a black person as a criminal, everyone's gonna feel a certain type of way about it. .... - Gil, actor

(metrics simplify value landscape, Nguyen 2021)

### 4. replication









#### Epic rocket prank fail. 😱

This live broadcast is a pre-recorded event. Please note that our vide are for entertainment purposes only and include scripted dramas, parodies, satires, magic tricks and other forms. Thank you for watchi



Do people replicate, mimic, and copy us? 100%. We copy them and they copy us. And we don't care. If anything that's a compliment to us and to them ... If you're trying to go viral, you copy what works. - Jules, magician

#### 4. replication



#### (side note: one outcome is "fake news")



cleaning lady GIFTED MASSIVE APT! 12 weeks ago · 113M Views 🗘 🔾 👺 1.9K



OMG I CANT BELIEVE SHE DID THAT T... 148K 221.3M Views · 20 weeks ago

situational authenticity + theft



fake news







Plane passenger sticks gum in inconsiderate woman's hair in viral TikTok

## 5. gamification



Live Views "I've used this analogy before. It's like a stadium...Like holy shit, how many views does the Superbowl get? l just can't fathom it." – Alex, live streamer

Addiction / Drugs / Dopamine It's a dopamine addiction. That's what social media is, so you get addicted to the dopamine, that's why people check their phones... When you watch live viewers go from 4,000 to 8,000 to 10,000 to 20,000 and then you go, Oh it's going back down and then BOOM! 32,000! It feels like, it feels like a drug. There's no there's, no other word. And that's why people do so well with this. - Tom, magician

#### 5. Gamification

It is like a casino, because the numbers don't always go up. You don't know if they're gonna go up or down. Every set of bad numbers is a new problem for me to solve: how do I get those numbers to go from red to green? It's compelling like a game. -- Rick, founder

(primacy of play, Schull 2012)

6. fusion

I've gone from thinking that we're making shitty videos to going, now we're making *great* entertainment and people *love* it. And that's, it's a disturbing thing for elitists and for people who like high art, because yeah, we are—we are creating shit. And people love it.

- Jude, magician

conclusions: the logic of cringe

Algorithms are never wrong.

Algorithms are infallible rules.

From the perspective of viral content creators, algorithms are accurate arbiters

(e.g., algorithms are an "camera," not an engine, MacKenzie 2006; Espeland and Sauder 2007)

Creative laborers enact what they expect will be algorithmically-valued choices.



ひ》

# scaling up to theory

### the influencer and the \$5,000 handbag



Abidin 2015; Bayme 2018; Christin 2020; Duffy 2018

#### towards a theory of the value of attention online (Bourdieu 1993; 1996)

SYMBOLIC CAPITAL

#### IG Influencers



Niche audiences Long term conversion Personal authenticity (Duffy 2017) Relational labor (Bayme 2016)

#### Content farms



Hought She Got MARRIED! ⊘ 5 weets ago -760.5M Views Mass audiences Short term conversion Situational authenticity Relational withdrawal Alienated labor

#### **ECONOMIC CAPITAL**

# end

resistance, the exception that proves the rule

I've always worked for my own pleasure. I've I've always worked because I want to change and inspire people.

If I can be the number one magician in the world, that's going to be awesome.

We are making a lot of money, that's, the synonym of success, but it's bad because money's always altering the relations.

Why do you do it? If you give me a good reason that is fulfilling for your life ...but don't do it just for the money, because you're going to be disappointed.

-- Xavier , 40, magician

#### MAGIC EXTRAORDINAIRE · 37

Magical, whimsical, enter the world of Xa



Super Human Shopping 🎲 😂 a year ago · 187.7M views 🕐 🗃 😮 Baptiste Molard, Seth Leach and 943



She THOUGHT She Got MARRIED! 🖉 45 weeks ago · 760.5M Views



## Theory: Attention capital in the field of online cultural production



Economic Capital (Low) Cultural Capital (Low) Attention is a valuable and finite resource for which digital laborers compete ("attention economy," Marwick 2013)

Attention capital

Different strategies for gaining, mobilizing, and profiting from attention capital, depending on where one is located in the space of online cultural production.

1. Authenticity 2. Audience imaginaries 3. Definitions of quality 4. Time horizons

### towards a theory of the value of attention online



#### Celebrities



Content farms



\_\_\_alienated judgement

#### **ECONOMIC CAPITAL**